

degree to which its absence as a rite of entry enhanced their status in Christianity. Expressing herself sceptical on the latter point, she asks what new symbols in Christianity maintained male dominance.

In the third section Lieu looks more generally at the complex problem of the presentation of Jews and Judaism in Christian sources. Some of the basic difficulties are set out in 'History and Theology in Christian Views of Judaism'. While accepting that all too often the Christian uses the Jew 'to think with' and presents an altogether abstract, biblical image of the Jew, a point she presses home in her second essay in the section on Christian presentations of Jewish persecution of Christians, Lieu allows for the occasional glimpse of an actual real Jewish presence. The section concludes with an examination of Christian presentations of Judaism manifest in the interpretation of Deuteronomy 21:23. Lieu argues that much interpretation and translation of this important passage has been distorted by various anti-Jewish trajectories and calls for an embrace of alternative readings.

The book concludes with a section entitled 'The Shaping of Early Christian Identity'. In each of the three essays in this section Lieu is keen to explore what one might call the non-given character of Christian identity in this early period, its emergent and sometimes elusive form. One essay looks at the ways in which this problematic quest for distinctiveness is manifested in the *Epistle of Diognetus* ('The Forging of Christian Identity and the *Letter of Diognetus*'), another examines the relationship of the New Testament to the issue of Christian identity, and a third emphasises the importance that issues of identity play in Christian martyrdom accounts. Throughout the section Lieu emphasises the continuities between the way these Christian texts relate to the issue under discussion and broadly contemporary Jewish texts.

This is a helpful collection which focuses on a broadly coherent theme. The essays are wide-ranging and show up their author's broad and detailed knowledge of both primary and secondary material. One is given a strong sense of the complexity of the subjects under discussion, not least because of the difficulty we encounter in dealing with texts (and it is texts with which Lieu is primarily concerned) with such a heavy rhetorical aspect—in fact much of what Lieu presents us with are a gradual unveilings of problems. As she herself writes: 'They [the essays] ... demonstrate its [early Christianity's] elusiveness, and so seek also to demonstrate the fragility of confident descriptions of what made "early Christianity"' (p. 7). Some may find this 'elusiveness' a touch trying on occasions, not least because, as Lieu herself concedes, by the second century a reasonable number of people, both insiders and outsiders, appeared to be able to refer either to themselves or to others as Christians. 'Fuzziness' may have been present in some instances but not in others. This is not, of course, to discard the view that Christian identity was and indeed still is something in the making but simply to ask for a little more clarity where it may in fact be possible to offer it. We should, however, be grateful to have this erudite collection so easily available to us, not least because of the many issues and problems with which it presents its reader.

University of Cambridge

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

JAMES M. SCOTT, *Geography in Early Judaism and Christianity: The Book of Jubilees* (Society for the New Testament Monograph Series 113). Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2002. viii, 337 pp. £50.00. ISBN 052180812X.

The title of this book caught my attention at once. Geography is all too often treated as the 'stepchild' of the numerous fields of study relevant to 'Early Judaism and Christianity'. What could be more important and timely, therefore, than a work devoted

primarily to geography in early Judaism and Christianity? However, a reader expecting to find a book on physical, landscape, human, settlement, economic, historical or political geography in Jubilees or in any other early Jewish or Christian work will be disappointed. Or anyone hoping to find new identifications to sites mentioned in these literatures will be looking in vain.<sup>1</sup> At best, the topic of this book might be described as 'World Geography' or 'Division of the Earth', the latter being a phrase used by Scott himself in one of the articles that served as the basis for this book.<sup>2</sup> Once, however, the reader understands what is not in the book, it is possible to judge the 'geography' for what it is, and while this reviewer has not been convinced of the all pervasive nature of Jubilees 8–9 in subsequent geographic Jewish and Christian literature, a matter to be discussed below, he has found the work to be an important contribution to the historiography of ancient geographic theory of both early Judaism and Christianity and heartily recommends it.

The geography that Scott focuses on is Jubilees 8–9, an expansion of the 'Table of Nations' in Genesis 10 (1 Chronicles 1) and in particular on the reception history of these chapters in Judaism and Christianity. Scott sets out to do this for three reasons (pp. 1–4): (1) his previous work (see n. 1) has pointed him in this direction; (2) New Testament Scholars have not given the study of the historical geography of the New Testament its proper attention; and (3) to provide a case study for the reception of 'so-called OT pseudepigrapha' in early Christian literature.

In these early pages the reader will still probably be confused by terminology. Thus, while Scott ultimately contributes little in terms of the study of 'micro' historical geography of the New Testament, he does provide important geographic insights, particularly from the 'inside', i.e. how the Jerusalem apostles, for example, might have imagined the world of their day. The reader seeking real historical geography of the New Testament, however, will have to look elsewhere. Also, while the reception history of OT Pseudepigrapha may be a legitimate realm of research, for those interested in geography, this is a tangential issue at best.

There is also a tremendous irony in this study, not cited by the author. The key text for Scott for the study of geography appears in a work whose author really was not interested in geography or ethnography.<sup>3</sup> Jubilees provides no details, for instance, regarding the 70 nations, unlike, for example, Josephus, who was apparently following Jubilees but seemed to be much more concerned with matters of general geography in his description of the nations (Josephus, *Ant.* 1.122–47).<sup>4</sup> The additional irony is that the author of Jubilees seems to have been conversant with Hellenistic science and geography—this becomes clear when Jubilees 8–9 is compared with parallel material in the *Genesis Apocryphon*—but he made use of it for anti-geographic purposes, stressing the differences between Shem and his brothers in order to keep Israel shut away from

<sup>1</sup> The classic work on sites in Jubilees, S. Klein, 'Palaestinisches im Jubiläenbuch', *ZDPV* 57 (1934), pp. 7–27, is not even mentioned in the bibliography.

<sup>2</sup> James M. Scott, 'The Division of the Earth in *Jubilees* 8:11–9:15 and Early Christian Chronography', in Matthias Albani *et al.* (eds), *Studies in the Book of Jubilees* (TSAJ 65; Mohr-Siebeck, Tübingen, 1997), pp. 295–323. See also *idem*, 'Geographic Aspects of Noachic Materials in the Scrolls at Qumran', in Stanley E. Porter and Craig A. Evans (eds), *The Scrolls and the Scriptures: Qumran Fifty Years After* (JSPSup 26; Roehampton Institute London Papers 3; Sheffield Academic Press, Sheffield, 1997), pp. 368–81.

<sup>3</sup> See Cana Werman, *The Attitude Towards Gentiles in the Book of Jubilees and Qumran Literature Compared with Early Tanaic (sic!) Halakha and Contemporary Pseudepigrapha*, unpublished doctoral dissertation, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1996, pp. 98–101 (in Hebrew).

<sup>4</sup> See the bibliography cited in *Flavius Josephus: Translation and Commentary* ed. Steve Mason, vol. 3: *Judean Antiquities 1–4*, translation and commentary by Louis H. Feldman, (E. J. Brill, Leiden/Boston/Köln, 2000), pp. 42–43.

the nations.<sup>5</sup>

After presenting his initial discussion of Jubilees 8–9 (pp. 23–35), the author moves on to examine its reception history in Jewish texts of the Second Temple period (pp. 35–39).<sup>6</sup> The discussion is rather limited. Scott deals with the *Third Sybil* and the *War Rule*. This material allows him to date the Jubilees traditions ('The Book of Noah') to the time of Antiochus III 'when Palestine became a political football between two rival powers in the East' and the 'perceived infringement of the Ptolomies and Seleucids on the inherited land of Israel may have sparked a strong reaction from a nationalistic author with an apocalyptic bent' (pp. 42–43). This is the extent of Scott's *systematic* analysis of Jewish geographic material of the Second Temple period. Since he does refer *passim* to much additional material from the Pseudepigrapha, Josephus and the Dead Sea Scrolls, it would have been beneficial if Scott had made some attempt to present this material in a systematic form, even if it did not necessarily help him in dating the Jubilees 8–9 material.

The weakest part of his presentation of the Jewish material is his discussion of the rabbinic tradition. This discussion is limited to citing a study of Martha Himmelfarb on the use of Jubilees 8–9 in the medieval *Midrash Aggadah*.<sup>7</sup> While one could well argue that rabbinic literature is not relevant to the 'Early Judaism' of the Second Temple period, especially when it appears in medieval works and therefore need not have been discussed at great length, if at all, if the author feels that this material is so important that it should be brought right after his discussion of the *Third Sybil* and the *War Rule*, then the relevant rabbinic material should be discussed properly. Scott does not seem to be aware of standard tools that would have provided much more in the way of rabbinic material, and some effort should have been made to provide systematic analysis of the rabbinic material on the Table of Nations such as that that appears in Genesis Rabbah 37.<sup>8</sup>

Scott certainly seems to be much more at home with the New Testament and with subsequent Christian literature. Shades of Jubilees 8–9 (and the Table of Nations) are found throughout Luke-Acts, such as in Jesus' genealogy (Lk. 3:28–38), the mission of the seventy (-two) (Lk. 10:1–24), Jesus' final words (Acts 1:1–11), Pentecost (Acts 2:1–13), the Miracle of Tongues (Acts 2:1–4), the List of Nations (Acts 2:9–11), and much more (pp. 44–96). While the case for the use of the 'Table of Nations' in Genesis 10 (and additional material on the nations there in chapters 9–11) seems more convincing sometimes than that for Jubilees 8–9, the overall evidence seems to allow for Scott's

<sup>5</sup> See Cana Werman 'The Book of Jubilees in Hellenistic Context', *Zion* 66 (2001), pp. 275–96 (in Hebrew). See also Scott, *Geography*, p. 33. For a different approach see Betsy Halpern-Amaru, *Rewriting the Bible: Land and Covenant in Postbiblical Jewish Literature* (Trinity Press, Valley Forge, PA, 1994), pp. 30–31. Halpern-Amaru claims that Jubilees 8–9 attempts to put the Noahide and Patriarchal covenants into a common context, releasing them from historic particularity.

<sup>6</sup> The first chapter of the work (pp. 5–22) is devoted to a discussion of the 'Mappamundi of Queen Kypros', which the author claims will provide a cameo 'of the subject at hand', as well as a fitting example of the kind of evidence available for the work and the inherent difficulties of the source material. While this chapter will eventually connect to the last one in the book, 'Medieval Mappaemundi' (pp. 159–70), Scott's rather flimsy proof of a possible Jewish source (e.g. weaving imagery and 'archaeological evidence') may disturb some readers.

<sup>7</sup> Martha Himmelfarb, 'Some Echoes of Jubilees in Medieval Hebrew Literature', in John C. Reeves (ed.), *Tracing the Threads: Studies in the Vitality of Jewish Pseudepigrapha* (SBLJL 6; Scholars Press, Atlanta, GA, 1994), pp. 115–41 (esp. 120–23).

<sup>8</sup> See, for example, Louis Ginzberg, *The Legends of the Jews* (Jewish Publication Society, Philadelphia, 1947) vol. I, p. 173, vol. V, pp. 194 ff., and particularly the references cited *ad loc.* See the explication of Genesis 10 in *Genesis Rabbah* 37 (pp. 343–50, ed. Theodor-Albeck) with reference to numerous parallels cited in the notes.

interpretation.

Once the case has been made for Luke-Acts, then it becomes possible to claim that world geography material in such works connected to Luke-Acts, and containing possibly Jewish-Christian source material, such as the Pseudo-Clementine *Recognitions* (1.27–71) is dependent upon Luke-Acts which is dependent upon Jubilees 8–9 (pp. 97–125). From here Scott goes on to those works which appear to have ties to Greek Jubilees and especially to those with geographic material. This is the case, for instance, regarding the second-century CE Christian apologist Theophilus of Antioch (pp. 126–34) and Hippolytus of Rome (pp. 135–58). Eventually Scott finds Jubilees 8–9 spreading its web of influence even over medieval *mappae mundi* (pp. 159–70).

Scott's chapters on early Christian geography lead to the conclusion that Jewish geographic theory, at least as interpreted by Scott, had dominant influence over central developments in Christian world geographic perceptions. While this idea is certainly intriguing, ultimately this view cannot be proven; although there is much in his presentation which is logical and perhaps correct, yet, as we have seen above, Scott's presentation of Jewish geographic theory is limited and, therefore, so are the implications on its connection to Christian geography.

In spite of the above, though, Scott has made an important contribution to the study of both early Jewish and Christian geographic thought and he has highlighted the importance of geography for the study of Judaism and Christianity. This is an important book and should be read by all those with an interest in either one or both of these religions.

Bar-Ilan University, Ramat-Gan, Israel

JOSHUA SCHWARTZ

GIUSEPPE VELTRI, *Gegenwart der Tradition. Studien zur jüdischen Literatur und Kulturgeschichte* (Suppl. to JSJ 69). E. J. Brill, Leiden, 2002. £65.50. ISBN 90-04-11686-9.

This collection of fifteen articles published between 1987 and 1997 focuses on various aspects of Jewish hermeneutics related to the Hebrew Bible and its translations, Jewish Hellenistic literature, rabbinic exegesis and Jewish magic. The articles have been slightly revised and corrected before their reprint and are supplemented by an introductory essay, an index of authors' names and a (rather brief) index of subject matter. A final bibliography and an index of sources are missing. To what extent the footnote references and contents of the respective articles have been updated to include relevant literature which appeared during the last five years remains unclear.

In the case of most such collections the thematic connection between the different parts is not immediately visible. In this case, however, recurrent issues and concerns link the articles and create an internal coherence. The recurrent theme concerns the various ways in which ancient Jewish writers transmitted the biblical tradition by actualising, translating, interpreting and canonising it. Always recognisable is the adaptation of traditions to new situations and circumstances, by different tradents, authors and editors, for a variety of purposes from ancient to medieval and modern times. Also at issue is the question of authority, within or outside the biblical text, which may limit the nature and scope of the text itself or its adaptations and meanings. Veltri emphasises the close connection between text and translation, translation and interpretation, author and reader. The interpreter is always part of the text, imbues the text with life and thereby (re)creates it. Yet hermeneutics also limits meaning: rules of interpretation always set norms and view the text from a particular perspective.

The book is divided into four parts: 1. The Rabbinic Understanding of Textual Transmission; 2. The Rabbinic Understanding of Translation; 3. The Transmission